

NOTAS

- 1 JURY VERDICT RESEARCH, CURRENT AWARD TRENDS IN PERSONAL INJURY: 43rd ed. (2004), 18.
- 2 *Id.*
- 3 *Id.*, at 18.
- 4 PHYSICIAN INSURERS ASS'N OF AM., PIAA CLAIM TREND ANALYSIS: 2002 ed. (2003), exhibit 1-2.
- 5 *Id.* at exhibit 6a.
- 6 Lori A. Bartholomew of PIAA, Remarks to the Am. Coll. Of Radiology (May 13, 2003).
- 7 JURY VERDICT RESEARCH, *supra* note 1, at 18.
- 8 *Id.* at 43.
- 9 BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ASS'N, THE MALPRACTICE INSURANCE CRISIS: THE IMPACT ON HEALTHCARE COST AND ACCESS 3 (2003).
- 10 Health Coalition on Liability and Access, *More Than Seven-In-Ten (72%) Americans Believe That Health Care Costs Are Rising Because of Medical Liability Lawsuits* (2004), available at <http://www.hcla.org/polldata/2004-HCLA-Poll.pdf> (last visited May 21, 2004).
- 11 AM. HOSP. ASS'N., PROF'L LIABILITY INS. SURVEY (2003).
- 12 BLUECROSS BLUESHIELD ASS'N, *supra* note 9, at 4.
- 13 MERITT, HAWKINS & ASSOC., SUMMARY REPORT: 2003 SURVEY OF FINAL YEAR MED. RESIDENTS 5 (2003).
- 14 Daniel Merinstein, *Winners and Losers* 291 JAMA 15, 15-6 (2004).
- 15 DIV. OF MKT. RESEARCH & ANALYSIS, AM. MED. ASS'N, AMA SURVEY: MED. STUDENTS' OPINIONS OF THE CURRENT MED. LIABILITY ENV'T (2003), available at <http://www.ama-assn.org/ama1/pub/upload/mm/31/msmlrhighlights.pdf> (last visited Feb. 16, 2004).
- 16 OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SEC'Y FOR PLANNING AND EVALUATION, U.S. DEP'T OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVS., ADDRESSING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS: REFORMING THE MEDICAL LITIGATION SYSTEM TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF HEALTH CARE 11 (2003) [hereinafter ADDRESSING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS].
- 17 *See* OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SEC'Y FOR PLANNING AND EVALUATION, U.S. DEP'T OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVS., UPDATE ON THE MEDICAL LITIGATION CRISIS: NOT THE RESULT OF THE "INSURANCE CYCLE" (2002) [hereinafter INSURANCE CYCLE], available at http://heal-fl-health-carepdf.netcomsus.com/resources_update_report.doc (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 18 *Id.* at 3.
- 19 OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SEC'Y FOR PLANNING AND EVALUATION, U.S. DEP'T OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVS., CONFRONTING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS, IMPROVING HEALTH CARE QUALITY & LOWERING COSTS BY FIXING OUR MED. LIABILITY SYS. 8 (2002) [hereinafter CONFRONTING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS], *disponible en* <http://aspe.hhs.gov/daltcp/reports/litrefm.pdf> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 20 ADDRESSING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS, *supra* note 16, at 11.
- 21 TILLINGHAST-TOWERS PERRIN, U.S. TORT COSTS: 2003 UPDATE: TRENDS AND FINDINGS ON THE COST OF THE U.S. TORT SYSTEM (2003) [hereinafter TILLINGHAST-TOWERS PERRIN], available at http://www.towersperrin.com/tillinghast/publications/reports/2003_Tort_Costs_Update/Tort_Costs_Trends_2003_Update.pdf (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 22 *Id.* at 2.
- 23 *Id.* at 1.
- 24 *Id.* at 1-2.
- 25 *Id.* at 19, 20.
- 26 *Id.* at 1.

- 27 *Costs and Compensation Paid in Tort Litigation: Hearing Before the Subcomm. on Trade, Productivity, and Econ. Growth of the Joint Econ. Comm. of the U.S. Cong.*, 99th Cong. (1986) (statement of James Kakalik & Nicholas Pace, RAND Institute for Civil Justice).
- 28 CONFRONTING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS, *supra* note 19, at 8.
- 29 PHYSICIAN INSURERS ASS'N OF AM., *supra* note 4, at exhibit 1-2, 6a.
- 30 BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ASS'N, *supra* note 9, at 2.
- 31 WIRTHLIN WORLDWIDE, THE MED. LIABILITY CRISIS: A FED. PROBLEM THAT REQUIRES A FED. SOLUTION, available at <http://www.hcla.org> (Last visited Feb. 12, 2004).
- 32 PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS, AM. ASS'N OF HEALTH PLANS, THE FACTORS FUELING RISING HEALTHCARE COSTS, 3 (2002), available at <http://www.aahp.org/InternalLinks/PwCFinalReport.pdf> (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).
- 33 HARRISINTERACTIVE INC., COMMON GOOD, COMMON GOOD FEAR OF LITIGATION STUDY: THE IMPACT ON MED. 65 (2002), available at http://ourcommongood.com/library/download/litrprt.pdf?item_id=10032 (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).
- 34 *Id.* at 57. See also, Stuart Taylor & Evan Thomas, *Civil Wars*, NEWSWEEK, Dec. 15, 2003 (detallando la cultura cada vez más pleiteadora de América y sus repercusiones en el trabajo cotidiano de los médicos y otros profesionales).
- 35 ADDRESSING THE NEW HEALTH CARE CRISIS, *supra* note 16.
- 36 ROBERT BERENSON ET AL., CTR. FOR STUDYING HEALTH SYS. CHANGE., *Medical Malpractice Liability Crisis Meets Markets: Stress in Unexpected Places*, (2003), available at <http://www.hschange.org/CONTENT/605/?words=malpractice> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 37 BLUECROSS BLUESHIELD ASS'N, *supra* note 9, at 3.
- 38 *Id.* at 8.
- 39 OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SEC'Y FOR PLANNING AND EVALUATION, U.S. DEP'T OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVS., SPECIAL UPDATE ON MED. LIABILITY CRISIS (2002) available at <http://aspe.hhs.gov/daltcp/reports/mlupd1.htm> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 40 See AM. MED. ASS'N, AM.'S MED. LIABILITY CRISIS: A NAT'L VIEW, available at http://www.amaassn.org/ama1/pub/upload/mm/-1/med_liab_19stat.pdf (last visited Feb. 11, 2004).
- 41 *Id.* BLUECROSS BLUESHIELD ASS'N, *supra* note 9, at 2.
- 43 *Id.*
- 44 *Id.* at 9.
- 45 *Id.*
- 46 *Id.*
- 47 Daniel P. Kessler & Mark B. McClellan, *The Effects of Malpractice Pressure and Liability Reforms on Physicians' Perceptions of Medical Care*, 60 LAW & CONTEMP. PROBS., 81-106 (1997).
- 48 Stephen Zuckerman, Randall R. Bovbjerg & Frank Sloan, *Effects of Tort Reforms and Other Factors on Medical Malpractice Insurance Premiums*, 27 INQUIRY 167-182 (1990).
- 49 DANIEL P. KESSLER & MARK B. MCCLELLAN, NAT'L BUR. OF ECON. ANALYSIS, DO DOCTORS PRACTICE DEFENSIVE MEDICINE?, 2 (1996), available at <http://www.nber.org/papers/w5466.pdf>. (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).
- 50 FRED HELLINGER & WILLIAM ENCINOSA, U.S. DEP'T OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVS., THE IMPACT OF STATE LAWS LIMITING MALPRACTICE AWARDS ON THE GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION OF PHYSICIANS (2003).
- 51 JOINT ECON. COMM., 108TH CONG., LIABILITY FOR MED. MALPRACTICE: ISSUES & EVIDENCE 19 (2003).
- 52 *Id.* Note: the updated figures through 2001, as calculated by the AMA according to NAIC data, are 245% and 750%, respectively. See NAT'L ASS'N OF INS. COMM'RS, PROFITABILITY BY LINE BY STATE, 1976-2001 (National Association of Insurance Commissioners Insurance Products & Services Division 2002), at 116-7.
- 53 JOINT ECON. COMM., *supra* note 51, at 24.
- 54 HEALTH SERVICES RESEARCH INST., PENN. MED. SOC'Y, PENNSYLVANIA'S MED. LIABILITY CRISIS & MED. MARKETPLACE ISSUES (2003).
- 55 Letter from James D. Hurley & Gail E. Tverberg, Tillinghast-Towers Perrin, to Ray Cantor, Med. Soc'y of N.J., 4 (Jan. 7, 2003) (on file with the Am. Med. Ass'n).
- 56 MO. REV. STAT. § 538.210 (2004).
- 57 Scott v. SSM Healthcare, 70 S.W.3d 560, 569, 571 (Mo. Ct. App. 2002).
- 58 FLA. STAT. ch. 766.118 (2004).
- 59 ID. REV. STAT. § 6-1603 (2004).
- 60 H.F. 2440, 80th Gen. Assem., Reg. Sess. (1a. 2004)

- 61 H.B. 13, Miss. Gen. Assem. 1st Extraordinary Sess.. (2004).
- 62 MISS. CODE ANN. § 11-1-60 (2004).
- 63 H.B. 1304, 92nd Gen. Assem., Reg. Sess. (Mo. 2004).
- 64 NEV. REV. STAT. § 41.A.031 (2004).
- 65 NEV. REV. STAT. § 41.503 (2004).
- 66 OHIO REV. CODE § 2323.43 (2004).
- 67 H.B. 2661, 49th Oklahoma Legislature, 2nd Reg. Sess. (2004).
- 68 OK CODE §63-1-1708.1F (2004).
- 69 PA H.B. 44 (2004) (enacted).
- 70 TEX. CIV. PRAC. & REM. § 74.301(2004).
- 71 un homenaje a la eficacia de la Proposición 12 vino poco después de su aprobación cuando el abogado del juicio de lesión personal y miembro de la legislatura de Oklahoma Stratton Taylor envió una carta suya a sus colegas de la ATLA en Texas para ofrecerles los servicios de su compañía a cualquier abogado de Texas que deseara presentar demandas en Oklahoma—donde no hay todavía ningún tope. Editorial, *Oklahoma!*, THE WALL ST. J., Dec. 19, 2003.
- 72 W. VA. CODE § 55-7B-8 (2004).
- 73 W. VA. CODE § 55-7B-9C (2004).
- 74 See *Evans v. State*, 56 P.3d 1046 (Alaska 2002); *Hoffman v. U.S.*, 767 F.2d 1431 (9th Cir. 1985); *Scholz v. Metro. Pathologists P.C.*, 851 P.2d 901 (Colo. 1993); *Kirkland v. Blaine County Med. Ctr.*, 4 P.3d 1115 (Idaho 2002); *Samsel v. Wheeler Transp. Serv., Inc.* 246 Kan. 336 (Kan. 1990); *Murphy v. Edmunds*, 601 A.2d 102 (Md. 1992); *Zdrojewski v. Murphy*, 657 N.W.2d 721 (Mich. Ct. App. 2002); *Adams v. Children’s Mercy Hosp.*, 848 S.W.2d 535 (Mo. Ct. App. 1993); *Linder v. Smith*, 629 P.2d 1187 (Mont. 1981); *Prendergast v. Nelson*, 256 N.W.2d 657 (Neb. 1977); *Gourley ex. rel. Gourley v. Neb. Methodist Health Sys.*, 633 N.W.2d 43 (Neb. 2003); *Etheridge, et. al. v. Med. Ctr. Hosp.*, 367 S.E.2d 525 (Va. 1989); *Robinson v. Charleston Area Med. Ctr.*, 186 W.Va. 720 (W. Va. 1991); *Verba v. Ghaphery*, 552 S.E.2d (W. Va. 2001); *Guzman v. St. Francis Hosp.*, 623 N.W.2d 776 (Wis. Ct. App. 2000).
- 75 *Johnson v. St. Vincent Hosp.*, 404 N.E.2d 585 (Ind. 1980); *Butler v. Flint Goodrich Hosp.*, 607 So.2d 517 (La. 1992), *Fed. Express Corp. v. U.S.*, 228 F. Supp. 2d 1267 (N.M. 2002).
- 76 LA. REV. STAT. § 40:1299.42(B)(1) (2003).
- 77 See *Moore v. Mobile Infirmary Ass’n*, 592 So.2d 156 (Ala. 1991); *Denton v. Con-Way S. Express, Inc.*, 402 S.E. 2d 269 (Ga. 1991); *Best v. Taylor Mach. Works*, 689 N.E.2d 1057 (Ill. 1997); *Kan. Malpractice Victims Coalition v. Bell*, 757 P.2d 251 (Kan. 1988) (new law enacted in 1988); *Carson v. Mauer*, 424 A.2d 825 (N.H. 1980); *Arneson v. Olson*, 270 N.W.2d (N.D. 1978); *State ex rel. Ohio Academy of Trial Lawyers v. Sheward*, 715 N.E. 2d 1062 (Oh.1999); *Lakin v. Senco Products, Inc.*, 987 P.2d 463 (Or. 1999); *Sofie v. Fibreboard Corp.*, 771 P.2d 711 (Wash.1989).
- 78 See *Univ. of Miami v. Echarte*, 618 So.2d 189 (Fla. 1993); *Lucas v. U.S.*, 757 S.W.2d 687 (Tex. 1988); *Rose v. Doctors Hosp.*, 801 S.W.2d 841 (Tex. 1990).
- 79 See cases cited *supra*, note 74.
- 80 CAL. CIV. CODE § 3333.2 (2004).
- 81 *Harming Patient Access to Care: The Impact of Excessive Litigation: Hearing Before the Subcomm. on Health of the Comm. on Energy and Commerce*, 107th Cong. 88(2002) [de aquí en adelante declaración de Anderson] (declaración de Richard E. Anderson, el presidente del Doctors’ Co. para el Physician Ins. Ass’n of Am.).
- 82 Phil Hinderberger, phil-hinderberger@norcalmutual.org, to asmac-l@unity.ama-assn.org (Jan. 20, 2003) .
- 83 See e.g., NAT’L ASS’N OF INS. COMM’RS, *supra* note 52. Statistics presented in *MLR – Now!* Ha sido derivado de estas y las versiones anteriores del informe que remonta a 1975.
- 84 Anderson statement, *supra* note 81.
- 85 INSURANCE CYCLE, *supra* note 17, at 4.
- 86 *Id.*
- 87 Med. Liability Monitor, 28 (2003). 88 CONG. BUDGET OFFICE, H. R. 5 HELP EFFICIENT, ACCESSIBLE, LOW-COST, TIMELY HEALTHCARE (HEALTH) ACT OF 2003 (2003), available at <http://www.cbo.gov/showdoc.cfm?index=4091&sequence=0> (last visited Feb. 10, 2004).
- 89 WIRTHLIN WORLDWIDE, AMERICAN’S BELIEVE ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE THREATENED BY MED. LIABILITY CRISIS (2003), available at <http://www.hcla.org> (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).
- 90 Health Coalition on Liability and Access, *supra* note 10.
- 91 U.S. GEN. ACCOUNTING OFFICE, MED. MALPRACTICE INS.: MULTIPLE FACTORS HAVE CONTRIBUTED TO

INCREASED PREMIUM RATES 15, 25, 32 (2003), available at <http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d03702.pdf> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

⁹² See e.g., AMERICANS FOR INS. REFORM, MED. MALPRACTICE INS.: STABLE LOSSES/UNSTABLE RATES 7 (2002),

available at <http://www.insurance-reform.org/StableLosses.pdf> (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).

⁹³AM BEST, BEST'S AGGREGATES & AVERAGES - PROPERTY/CASUALTY, QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS REPORT, MED.

MALPRACTICE PREDOMINATING: 2003 ed. (2003), 335.

⁹⁴ Holly Saelens of OH Dep't of Ins., Remarks entitled "Med. Malpractice Ins.," at 19.

⁹⁵ *Id.* at 18.

⁹⁶ Raghu Ramachandran, *Did Investments Affect Medical Malpractice Premiums?*, Jan. 21, 2003, available at <http://salsa.bbh.com/news/Articles/MedMal.html> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

⁹⁷ Raghu Ramachandran, *A Note on Investment Income of Medical Malpractice Companies*, Feb. 4, 2003, available at <http://salsa.bbh.com/news/Articles/medmal2.html> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

⁹⁸ INSURANCE CYCLE, *supra* note 17, at 1.

⁹⁹ *Id.* at 3.

¹⁰⁰ *Id.*

¹⁰¹ AM. ASS'N OF HEALTH PLANS, "LAWSUIT LOTTERY" CAUSES MED. MALPRACTICE CRISIS—SUGGESTIONS THAT

POOR INVESTMENTS LED TO CRISIS DON'T PASS SMELL TEST 1, available at

<http://www.americanbenefitscouncil.org/documents/refutingstockmarketargument.pdf> (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).

¹⁰² *Id.*

¹⁰³ *Id.*

¹⁰⁴ See e.g., *Health Care Litigation Reform: Does Limitless Litigation Restrict Access to Health Care?: Hearing*

Before the Subcomm. on Commercial and Admin. Law of the Comm. on the Judiciary, 107th Cong. 64 (2002)

(statement of Lawrence E. Smarr, Pres. of Physician Ins. Ass'n of Am.) *citing to* Tillinghast - Towers Perrin,

Medical Malpractice - Market Review and Update, (Mar. 2002), AM BEST, *supra* note 93.

¹⁰⁵ See e.g., ASS'N OF TRIAL LAWYERS OF AM., MED. MALPRACTICE FIBS & FACTS, available at

http://www.atla.org/ConsumerMediaResources/Tier3/press_room/FACTS/medmal/medmalfibsfacts.aspx (last visited Feb. 12, 2004).

¹⁰⁶ TILLINGHAST-TOWERS PERRIN, *supra* note 21 at 1-2.

¹⁰⁷ Med. Liability Monitor, *supra* note 87, at 28.

¹⁰⁸ See, CONG. BUDGET OFFICE, LIMITING TORT LIABILITY FOR MED. MALPRACTICE, (2004) (La notificación que, "por término medio, las primas para todos los médicos por toda la nación aumentaron por 15 por ciento entre 2000 y 2002" (*Id.* a 1)) , disponible [aftp://ftp.cbo.gov/49xx/doc4968/01-08-MedicalMalpractice.pdf](http://ftp.cbo.gov/49xx/doc4968/01-08-MedicalMalpractice.pdf) (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

¹⁰⁹ Kenneth E. Thorpe, *The Medical Malpractice 'Crisis': Recent Trends and the Impact of State Tort Reforms*, HEALTH AFFAIRS, Jan. 21, 2004, at 28, available at <http://content.healthaffairs.org/cgi/reprint/hlthaff.w4.20v1.pdf> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

¹¹⁰ Troyen A. Brennan, Colin M. Sox & Helen R. Burstin, *Relation between Negligent Adverse Events and the Outcomes of Medical-Malpractice Litigation*, 335 N. ENG. J. MED. 1963 (1996).

¹¹¹ BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ASS'N, *supra* note 9, at 2.

¹¹² AM BEST, *supra* note 93, at 356. See also, Saelens *supra* note 92.

¹¹³ AM BEST, *supra* note 93, at 350.

¹¹⁴ *Id.* at 350, 364.

¹¹⁵ U.S. GEN. ACCOUNTING OFFICE, MED. MALPRACTICE INS.: MULTIPLE FACTORS HAVE CONTRIBUTED TO INCREASED PREMIUM RATES *supra* note 89, at 15.

¹¹⁶ U.S. GEN. ACCOUNTING OFFICE, MED. MALPRACTICE: IMPLICATIONS OF RISING PREMIUMS ON ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE (2003), available at <http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d03836.pdf> (last visited Feb. 3, 2004).

117 *See e.g.*, HEALTH SERVICES RESEARCH INST., *supra* note 54(Llega a la conclusión de que la encuesta probatoria es engañosa e inadecuada del GAO contribuyó a no identificar un problema de acceso en curso y de empeoramiento).

118 David Studdert, Michelle Mello & Troyen Brennan, *Medical Malpractice*, 350 NEW ENG. J. MED., 283, 287 (2004).

119 PAUL C. WIELER ET AL., A MEASURE OF MALPRACTICE: MEDICAL INJURY, MALPRACTICE LITIGATION & PATIENT

COMPENSATION 140 (Harvard University Press 1993).

120 *Id.* at 139.

121 *Id.* at 140.

122 Troyen A. Brennan, Colin M. Sox & Helen R. Burstin, *supra* note 110.

123 *Id.* at 1965.

124 Por Ejemplo, McDonald et al. encuentran que los estudios subyacentes del informe de OIM fueron “de observación,” no concebido para “describir las relaciones causales”. Los autores declaran que “el estudio de Harvard no incluye ninguna información acerca del riesgo de puntos de comparación de la muerte en estos pacientes o información acerca de las defunciones en cualquier grupo de comparación. Por consiguiente, no puede determinarse ya sea los fenómenos adversos se correlacionan con si causan la muerte”. Los autores comentan que la “confianza en los estudios sin controles para hacer las afirmaciones de titulares acerca de números enormes de muertes evitables era un error que no se sostuvo.”. *Ve r*Clement J. McDonald et al., *Deaths Due to Medical Errors Are Exaggerated in Institute of Medicine Report*, 284 JAMA 93, 93 (2000).